DYNAMICS OF DEMOCRACY AND HUMAN RIGHTS AMONG THE NDEBELE OF ZIMBABWE, 1818-1934

BY

SABELO JEREMIAH NDLOVU-GATSHENI

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of History
Faculty of Arts
University of Zimbabwe

September 2003
ABSTRACT

This thesis is at once a profound historical reconstruction of an African polity, and a deeply informed mediation on key Ndebele concepts and ideas. Throughout the thesis, the Ndebele historical experiences are consistently discussed in relation to a broad range of historiography and critical-scientific theory of hegemony and democracy and human rights.

The analysis is specifically focused on the destruction of the autonomy of the decentralized Khumalo clans, the construction of Ndebele hegemony in the midst of the Mfecane revolution, the expansion of the Ndebele state into a tolerant and heterogeneous settled nation north of the Limpopo river, the colonial encounter with the Ndebele state in the 1860s, imperialist violence of the 1890s, and the subsequent colonization of the Ndebele. These concrete historical processes marked the long and complex experiences of the Ndebele, which witnessed a clash of hegemonic projects and re-configuration of power politics. The history of the Ndebele was consistently characterized by the ambiguity of tendencies of domination versus resistance as the Ndebele rebelled against both pre-colonial African despots like Zwide and Shaka as well as against colonial conquest. The Ndebele also fought to achieve material security, political autonomy, cultural independence, social justice, human dignity and tolerant governance even within their state in the face of an Ndebele ruling elite that sought to maintain its political dominance and material privileges through a delicate combination of patronage, accountability, exploitation, and limited coercion.

Thus the thesis is centred on the problem of the relation between coercion and consent during different phases of Ndebele history up to their encounter with colonialism. The analysis, therefore, outlines major shifts from migratory kingdom to settlement and highlights contradictions, conflict, tension and social cleavages that permitted conquest, desertions, raiding, assimilation, domination, exploitation as well as social security, communalism and tolerance as values which combined and co-existed uneasily, periodically and tendentiously in the Ndebele society and that were articulated in varied and changing idioms, languages, cultural traditions and institutions.

Finally, the thesis shows how the Ndebele tried to resist western imperialist forces which were intolerant of their sovereignty and cultural autonomy, and brings out aspects of clashes between concepts of rights and how the British imperialists used a combination of open violence on the Ndebele and looting of their material wealth to destroy the Ndebele state between 1893 and 1897. It also grapples with some of the ambiguities and contradictions of the colonial encounter and the equally ambiguous Ndebele reaction to early colonial rule in the period 1898 to 1934. Moreover, from a longer-term perspective, the issues raised by the study have important resonance with current concerns around democratization, sovereignty, legitimacy, and violence in Zimbabwe.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was made possible by the encouragement, help, and interest of many people, but space can only allow me to single out a few. I am greatly indebted to Professor T.O. Ranger as my principal supervisor for reading and commenting on the draft chapters of this thesis and for providing the intellectual and professional guidance. I am also indebted to Dr K. D. Manungo for taking over the supervision of the thesis after Professor Ranger had left the country for Britain in July 2001.

Special debt is also owed to Professor Brian Raftopolous who became very critical during the defence of this thesis and for his advice on the improvement of my theoretical framework. I must not forget the encouragement I got from Drs Joseph P. Mtisi, Innocent Pikirayi, Martin Rupiya, and Josephine Nhongo-Simbanegavi of the University of Zimbabwe, as well as my colleagues Mr. Peter Mayavo, Terence Mashingaidze, Finnex Ndhlouvu, Sally Ntabeni, and Godfrey T. Ncube of the Midlands State University. Special debt is also owed to my friends and colleagues at the University of Zimbabwe namely, Gerald Mazarire, Munyadzidzai Mushonga and Dr James Muzondidya. I must not forget my UK friends Chizuko Sato from Japan and Wendy Willems from Denmark who were also working on their PhDs at Oxford and SOAS respectively.

This study could never have materialized without the support of Professor N. Bhebe in his capacity as the coordinator of The Historical Dimensions of Democracy and Human Rights in Zimbabwe Project sponsored by the Swedish Agency for Research Co-operation with Developing Countries (SAREC). He co-opted me into the Project as a
researcher and I benefited immensely from the funding as well as in the form of testing my ideas through seminar presentations.

I also owe special debt to the staff of University of Zimbabwe Main Library, University of Zimbabwe Law Library, Institute of Development Studies (IDS) Library, National Archives of Zimbabwe, Bulawayo Records Centre as well as the various people who shared their knowledge of various aspects of Ndebele past with me.

My parents (the late Jeremiah Menye Sayimana Ndlovu-Gatsheni and Elinah Tswetasi Ndlovu-Gatsheni nee Nyathi) as well as the whole family, especially my young brother, Morgan Ndlovu-Gatsheni who is at Witwatersrand University (South Africa), I thank them for remaining a constant source of encouragement and for financial support. Morgan has always appreciated my academic work. To my wife, Nontando Isabel, who has borne so well all those lonely days and hours while at the same time she maintained, in spite of her own most demanding consultancy duties at Midlands Open Consultancy (M.O.C), a domestic atmosphere conducive for my intellectual fulfillment, I owe her a very special and priceless debt. It is to my son Vulindlela Kings Zwelithini and my late father, Mr. Jeremiah Menye Sayimana Ndlovu-Gatsheni, that I dedicate this thesis. May my father’s support in my academic work endure forever and ever. I will always emulate his solid guidance as a parent.

The revisions of this thesis were done while I was on contact visit at St. Anthony’s College, University of Oxford in the months of June and July 2003. Therefore, special
thanks go to Professors Terence Ranger and William Beinart for inviting and hosting me in Oxford. I must not forget the help I received from the Directors of North Oxford Overseas Centre (NOOC), Tim and Judy Rous, and the Administrator, Kathrine Hart, for extending to me financial assistance from the William Nagenda Fund to cover my last days of stay at NOOC. I was able to use my stay at Oxford to do research at Bodleian and Rhodes House Libraries.

I enjoyed the friendship and academic discussions with Marieke Faber Clarke on gender aspects in the Ndebele state and Mqondobanzi Magonya on the Ndebele politics in general. Finally, I wish to record my sincere thanks to Irvin and Gwen Nyathi, for being my first hosts in the UK and for treating me as part of their family at their house in Essex. Nkosiilathi (NICK) and his wife MaDube hosted me at their home in Wolverhampton. I benefited much from Nick and Irvin’s PCs for some of the revisions of this thesis. Maxwell Masuku and his wife Rhu became very good friends in the UK and I was always welcomed at their home in Basildon.
CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................... ii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .................................................................................. ii

CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... vi

FIGURES ........................................................................................................ ix

ABBREVIATIONS ............................................................................................ x

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................. 2

Endnotes .......................................................................................................... 10

1. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ...................................................... 12

  1.1 Antonio Gramsci’s Theory of Hegemony ........................................ 12
  1.2 The Radical Materialist Conception of Democracy and Human
      Rights ...................................................................................................... 16
  1.3 The Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948 ..................... 19
  1.4 A Review of Available Literature ...................................................... 21
  1.5 A Brief Note on Primary Sources ...................................................... 37

Endnotes .......................................................................................................... 41

2. EMERGENCE OF NDEBELE HEGEMONY AND THE HUMAN
   RIGHTS PROBLEM, 1818–1842 ............................................................. 47

  2.1 The Mfecane Controversy and the Ndebele ................................. 49
  2.2 The Autonomous Khumalo Clans Prior to the Mfecane .............. 55
  2.3 The Mfecane and the Fate of the Khumalo, 1818 – 1825 ............ 58
  2.4 The Ndebele State South of the Limpopo River, 1826 – 1837 ....... 62
  2.5 Establishment of the Ndebele State in Zimbabwe, 1838 – 1842 ....... 67

Endnotes .......................................................................................................... 72

3. GOVERNANCE AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE NDEBELE IN THE
   19th CENTURY ....................................................................................... 76

  3.1 Settled Life and the New Political Realities ................................... 77
  3.2 Notions of Power and Governance .................................................. 80
3.3 Accountability and Legitimacy .................................................88
3.4 Forms of Oppression and Domination ....................................94
3.5 Captives .................................................................................97
3.6 Gender Relations ..................................................................104
3.7 Notions of Justice and Punishment ........................................115

Endnotes .......................................................................................126

4. DYNAMICS OF COERCION AND CONSENT IN THE NDEBELE STATE .................................................................134

4.1 Use of Amabutho .................................................................135
4.2 Use of Amabutho as Instruments of Violence .......................142
4.3 Use of Ritual Power by the Ruling Elite .................................151
4.4 Ndebele Cultural Practice and Civil Society ..........................163

Endnotes .......................................................................................168

5. A CLASH OF HEGEMONIC PROJECTS: THE NDEBELE VERSUS MISSIONARIES .............................................................172

5.1 The Encounter Between the Whites and the Ndebele ..........177
5.2 The Ndebele Kingship and the Challenge of Western Influences ....184
5.3 Ndebele Religious Practitioners and Western Ideas .................190
5.4 Other Ndebele People’s Responses to Whites .......................194
5.5 The Few Who Embraced White Religion ...............................196
5.6 Imperial Interests and the Ndebele State .................................201

Endnotes .......................................................................................206

6. IMPERIAL VIOLENCE AND THE DESTRUCTION OF THE NDEBELE STATE, 1890–897 .............................................................210

6.1 Imperial Instigation of Violence Between the Shona and the Ndebele, 1890–1893 .................................................................212
6.2 Direct White Violence on the Ndebele ....................................217
6.3 The Impact of White Conquest on the Ndebele, 1893–1895 .......222
6.4 Removal of Ndebele Kingship and Reduction of Ndebele Chiefs into Colonial Civil Servants .........................................................228
6.5 White Acquisition of Ndebele Land .......................................234
6.6 The Reduction of the Ndebele into Mine and Farm Labourers ..236
6.7 The Last Stand of the Ndebele Against Colonial Rule ............239

Endnotes .......................................................................................247

7. THE COLONIAL STATE AND THE NDEBELE, 1898-1934 ..........252
## FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figures</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>HIERARCHY OF POWER AMONG THE NDEBELE. 81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>NATIVE DEPARTMENT HIERARCHY OF POWER. 213</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABBREVIATIONS

A. M. E. C  American Episcopal Church
A. M. H. C  Africa Mission Home Church
B.B.P  Bechuanaland Border Police
B.S.A.Co.  British South Africa Company
B.S.A.P  British South African Police
CODESRIA  Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa
C.N.C  Chief Native Commissioner
D. R. C  Dutch Reformed Church
(ed.)/ (eds.)  Editor/Editors
Fig.  Figure
I.D.S  Institute of Development Studies
Jr.  Junior
L.M.S  London Missionary Society
M.H.S.  Matebele Home Society
NADA  Native Affairs Department Annual
NC/NCs  Native Commissioner(s)
No.  Number
Rev.  Reverend
R. B. V. A  Rhodesia Bantu Voters Association
R. I. C. U  Rhodesia Industrial Commercial Workers Union
SAPES  Southern African Political Economy Series
Vol./Vols.  Volume(s)
Wits.  Witwatersrand.
Z. P. H  Zimbabwe Publishing House